Lippincott took his prisoner aboard the British man-o'-war Brittania, to be held for exchange. Another friend of Lippincott's, one Philip White, had been taken prisoner by the patriots, and Lippincott was holding Huddy to exchange for White.

While Huddy was still in prison, White attempted to escape and was shot. Thereupon Lippincott determined to get rid of Huddy in reprisal. Under a heavy guard Huddy was taken ashore at Gravelly Point, at the foot of Atlantic Highlands. A rough gallows was fashioned out of three fence rails and a barrel. Time was allowed for the brave captain to sign his will, drawn up for him by John McQuire, a teacher at the Garrett Hill school. Placing the document on the barrel from which he was to drop to death he put his name to it. It is said that he shook hands with his old neighbor and said, "I shall die innocent and in a good cause."

Lippincott's men were reluctant to draw the rope and it is said that Lippincott took hold and with the help of a few others swung Huddy into eternity. The hanging took place at ten in the morning and at four the body was found with a placard pinned to it, reading: "Up Goes Huddy for Philip White."

Tremendous indignation arose from this incident. Citizens of Monmouth County met at Freehold and petitioned Washington for some sort of reprisal. The act was pronounced a barbaric murder. Washington sent a hot protest to General Clinton, British commander, declaring that if Huddy's murderers were not given up he would be forced to execute an imprisoned British officer. Clinton ignored the demand, and lots were drawn among the captured British officers to decide the one doomed to death.

The draw fell upon Captain Charles Asgill, a mere boy barely 19 years of age. Washington himself was pained at the choice. Asgill was a gallant officer and beloved even by his captors. He came of a noble and influential family, and every effort was made to save him. His mother desperately appealed for his life, but the British could do nothing against the adamant Washington. She induced the King and Queen of Holland to intervene for him. When this was unsuccessful she turned to the Count De Vergennes, Foreign Minister of France, America's powerful ally. Vergennes addressed to Washington a petition that could not be denied. Washington, only too glad for a way out of the painful dilemma, referred the matter to Congress, and Asgill was spared. Three times he had bravely walked to what he thought was inevitable execution, each time to be saved by an order from Washington postponing the ordeal. Then his sentence was revoked.

But the saving of Asgill did nothing to bring Huddy back to life. His body was taken to Freehold and buried in the cemetery of Old Tennent Church, in the presence of a vast and indignant throng. The Rev. John Woodhull, famed pulpit orator of his time, preached the funeral sermon.

Huddy's grave was neglected and now its location has been lost. But near the town of Water Witch, at the foot of Atlantic Highlands, where Huddy was hanged, is a monument that perpetuates his fame and proclaims his unjust end.